Full Length Article

Open Access

Driving loyalty through satisfaction and Trust in e-environment: A case of developing Country

Muhammad Zeeshan¹, Rizwana Bashir²

¹Assistant Professor, UCP Business School - University of Central Punjab, Lahore Pakistan

²Associate Professor, UCP Business School - University of Central Punjab Lahore, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

Purpose – The objective of this study is to determine the factors that contribute to online shopping loyalty in Malaysian's e-retailing environment.

Design/methodology/approach–The research aim of this study focuses on Malaysian consumers. The study undertakes an empirical approach and therefore, data were collected through a self-administered online questionnaire and 291 responses were found to be usable. The structural equation modelling technique was used for the analysis of the data with the help of AMOS 22.

Findings–The empirical results show that website perceived usefulness, ease of use, privacy/security and e-scape are significant predictors of web site e-satisfaction and e-trust. Furthermore, to establish an online loyalty, companies need to focus their attention on e-satisfaction and e-trust.

Practical Implications – Although previous studies have investigated the pertinent issues about online retailing. However, very few studies have been conducted in developing countries like Malaysia. Furthermore, this study proposes a research framework which could be helpful for e-retailers to enhance consumes value by strategically focusing on online shopping loyalty.

Originality/Value – The empirical results of this study address a serious gap in the existing literature especially in the context of an emerging country in the context of e-retailing.

Keywords: Online, satisfaction, customer, trust, Loyalty.

1. INTRODUCTION

In recent times almost every company has tried to establish its way to the internet including multinational corporations, international bookstores, and the local bakery around the corner in an attempt to interact with customers via their web sites (Kerkhof and Noort, 2010). General public awareness of e-retailing has been on the rise and thus individuals are prepared to shift to technology applications. Therefore, combining a “click-and-brick” strategy with the company’s brick-and-mortar” operations is nowadays has become vital to a firm’s overall profitability and success in the marketplace (Akbar

Address of Correspondence

Rizwana Bashir
rizwana.bashir@ucp.edu.pk

Article info

Received Sept 3, 2018
Accepted May 12, 2019
Published June 30, 2019

and Parvez, 2009). Retailers are competing to increase offline as well as online market share. Transferring between customers from customary store-based channel to the online channel increase pressure on brick and mortar retailers to complement offline presence with an online presence. Furthermore, diffusion of the internet as a communication tool and business medium in the consumer marketplace is rising and online delivery channels have great potential (Punyatoya, 2018).

Online shopping (sometimes called as e-shopping) has transformed the manner customers purchase services and products (Pandey and Chawla, 2018). Online shopping has enabled customers with extensive assortments, a lot of goods information, time-efficient and spatial benefits. Various customers today purchase goods and/or services from online shopping websites (eg. Lazada.my, ebay.com, etc) instead of visiting a traditional retail store. With this growing significance of online sales and the growing number of online shoppers purchasing online, marketers need to develop an enhanced understanding of online customers (Thakur, 2018). To develop and improve this understanding, Tankovic and Benazic (2018) narrated that both researchers and online vendors must realize the backgrounds of customer recognition of online shopping. Similarly, Zheng, Lee and Cheung (2017) claims that utmost customer behaviour concepts and models have been established and verified entirely in advanced countries, thus, it is vital to recognize the factors of customer satisfaction and loyalty in the Malaysian context.

To achieve the online business growth hundreds of millions of dollars are being spent by organizations (Tsao, Hsieh and Lin, 2016). For example, in Europe, 22% growth has been recorded for the e-commerce business while in 2014 the volume of business has surpassed €200 billion (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018). Since a major portion of online transaction is performed online it becomes crucial for a business to develop and maintain the high level of customers trust level. It is significant to comprehend how the overall design of e-environment systems influence consumer reaction and loyalty. Many studies in the past have been conducted in the area of e-environment, the associations among e-environment with the loyalty have been underexposed. Therefore, this paper seeks to explore the factors which influence loyalty through satisfaction and trust in the online

environment. Past literature also suggests the relationship between e-trust and e-satisfaction. This paper further extends this phenomenon by empirically investigating the outcome of e-trust and e-satisfaction namely, e-loyalty.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Malaysian Online Shoppers

Malaysia is the 13th biggest economy in the world and 5th in Asia. The Malaysian government has set an aggressive target called vision 2020 to become a full-fledge advanced country. As Malaysia is moving towards this target customers are playing a vigorous role in shopping, both in brick-and-mortar stores and online. Contemporary eras have observed the creation of a main directional revolution in online shopping behavior particularly by the younger group (Khan and Rahman, 2016). Well-matched with the radical constituents of the online marketplace, Malaysia has aggressively established e-commerce facilities since mid-2000. Moving towards a developed country target by 2020 with service-based economy as the background, the computer and online way of lifestyle is increasing in Malaysia. In this scenario, shopping online is a major growing lifestyle trend in Malaysia (Wang and Kim, 2019). With a solid buildup on broadband facilities and multimedia super corridor which has transformed the lifestyle of the customers, and more business-to-business (B2B) operation employing the online platform.

E-Commerce is a rising portion of the Malaysian economy and displays growing potential, as both foreign and local businesses enlarge their online facilities in Malaysia (Butt and Aftab, 2012). Some of the important advances in last 10 years include online coupon-giant Groupon entering the Malaysian marketplace, payment portal PayPal inaugural a global operations centre in Malaysia, the introduction of new guidelines in the country to shield online customers and introduction of a programme for micro-industries to register for broadband accounts and to form websites for their goods (called Get Malaysian Business Online-GMBO). With this expansion of internet and computer usage, the electronic distribution of products and services has developed obvious and almost mandatory for meeting customer's expectations (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018).

The underpinning theory used in this paper is the Technology Acceptance Model or (TAM) developed by (Davis, 1989). TAM has been the most extensively used theory in the area of technology. The model claimed that perceived ease of use and perceived usefulness plays a crucial role in consumer behavior. Some components of TAM are adopted from the theory of reasoned action (TRA). The research framework is derived mainly from variables presented in TAM. It would be worth investigating this theory with some added concepts like loyalty.

Despite these advances in online shopping, many Malaysian vendors are yet unwilling to practice online transaction as a marketing channel because, the attitude and response of their customers through the online purchasing is yet anonymous and unclear (Tandon, Kiran and Sah, 2016). Furthermore, the online channel has some serious challenges like poor service performance such as content fault and interruption in distribution or businesses (Sreejesh, and Ponnamm, 2016) which are averting the actual businesses via the online channel. A survey conducted in 2017 by the Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission, 10.4 percent of the internet consumers intended to ordering products and/or services online (MCMC-Skmm.gov.my, 2017). Consequently, here is a massive prospect for businesses to grow their business actions and use online to market and focus potential customers. The conceptual framework is presented in figure 1.

Figure 1: Conceptual model

2.2 Perceived usefulness

Perceived usefulness signifies the user's evaluation related to the functional advantages of system application, such as the system's help of improving efficiency and effectiveness in the achievement of a particular task (Zheng, Lee, and Cheung, 2017). High vocal difficulty and traditional web site features are not able to convince online shoppers (Tsao, Hsieh, and Lin, 2016). It motivates consumers to transact online. Therefore, to increase shoppers online purchase intentions perceived usefulness must be enhanced. Kesharwani, Sreeram, and Desai (2017) narrated that direct experience with the system also significantly improves the association among apparent usefulness and behavior intentions. Thus, past literature suggests that perceived usefulness influences satisfaction and trust. Therefore, this study hypothesized that:

H₁: Perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction.

H₂: Perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-trust.

2.3 Perceived Ease of Use

Perceived ease-of-use is the online shopper confidence that a specific system is effortless (Thakur, 2018). It shows easiness with which online shoppers can navigate the website, including the usefulness of the design and organization of the material and visuals on the website. However, Pandey and Chawla (2018) narrated that high performance on ease of use may be very hard to accomplish. This becomes harder as to how a firms develop website features varies depending on firm level characteristics, which may include target market, product, and services (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018). For example, ease of use will be different for an online seller selling software compare to an online seller selling books in terms of technical complication. The target markets for the respected seller also vary in terms of their technical expertise and familiarity. Therefore, each seller must understand and incorporate the target market needs in their system to deliver the better perception of ease of use compared to other sellers.

For example, self-service technologies may also influence customer satisfaction and trust in the online environment (Punyatoya, 2018). Many benefits have been attributed to enhancing online shopper's perceptions about ease of use. For example, these benefits include convenience (Khan and Rahman 2016), saving money and time

(Wang and Kim, 2019), avoiding personal contact (Kaura, Prasad and Sharma, 2015), and being in control (Pandey and Chawla, 2018). Riquelme and Román (2014) narrated that on the website and internet technology satisfaction is driven by the easiness of the system. He further argued that perceived ease-of-use is the central determinant in expecting online shopper usage of the system. In the same context, Zheng, Lee, and Cheung (2017) claimed that ease of use influences e-loyalty mainly secondarily, via fulfillment and trust. It means that the capability to effortlessly route a website and its apparent ease of use (e.g. entertainment, accessibility, communal) will affect usage level and fulfillment and trust. Therefore, this study hypothesized that:

H₃: Perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction.

H₄: Perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-trust.

2.4 Privacy / Security

Generally, the idea of privacy is quite old to online shopping environment and defined as a person's capability to oversee the conditions by which his or her private information is collected and used (Francis, Hasna, Park and Wu, 2015). In an online shopping context, consumer privacy is a procedural device and/or strategy to guard client information against unapproved use or revelation. If customers perceive this privacy policy safe, they would be willing to share their individual and transactional data while making a purchase online (Lim, Heng and Cheah, 2016). This will increase customer's confidence on an online merchant's capability to protect his or her data, which will also reduce insecurity and improve trust. Past literature shows that perceived online privacy is one of the main aspects of creating e-trust (Tandon, Kiran and Sah, 2016).

Whereas, Security illustrates the user's opinions concerning the trustworthiness related to means of payment used and the procedures of data transfer and storage (Lemon and Verhoef, 2016). Although in today's online marketplace security measures and techniques to protect user data have continued to advance and expand, website security is still a major concern of user, and established security measures are frequently breached, even amongst extensively trustworthy firms (Shobeiri, Mazaheri and Laroche, 2018). This concern may adversely affect customers' opinions about online businesses' capabilities to avert the website from invasions, causing reduced e-trust and satisfaction.

Therefore, website security is one of the chief hurdles to the growth and acceptance of online shopping and e-commerce at large (Davis, 1989).

The link between Privacy and Security: Privacy is associated with a bundle of lawful requirements and decent perform concerning the management of individual user data, for example sharing with users that how their data will be collected and used in the future (Faqih, 2016). While security denotes to technical assurances that confirm that the lawful necessities and decent practices with respect to the management of individual user data will be effectively met. It must be important to mention here that an online firm may promise data protection. Yet hackers may be able to get access to the data and use it criminally. This assault of privacy might be prohibited by the use of appropriate security procedures. McLean and Wilson (2016) claimed that the close association among the notions of privacy and security can be comprehended in three clearly diverse areas. First, it would be noted that shoppers do not make a perfect division; all they need is that their privacy is safeguard. Second, companies incline to treat both ideas together. Third, public organizations sight both conceptions as moving together. Therefore, this study hypothesized that:

H₅. Perceived online security/privacy is positively associated with e-satisfaction.

H₆. Perceived online security/privacy is positively associated with e-trust

2.5 E-Scape

In the e-retailing context, e-scape refers to website design (Tran and Strutton, 2016). Besides easy to use, an online shopping website must be appealing to the visitor. The Internet presents a task to review the physical signals in cyberspace, also termed the e-scape as more service encounters take place through web sites as an alternative of shopper visits to retailers. Web site design or e-scape may be tailored to the user's needs and be pivotal for shopper satisfaction. Wu, Quyen and Rivas (2016) narrated that one of the main features of any online shopping website is its option to be personalized to visitor's needs. However, the non-inclusion of the human element makes it difficult to achieve this personalization. Therefore, e-retailers should attempt to customized e-scape that to the user's needs as much as possible. The online retailer may focus on loyal customers for e-scape enhancements (Sreejesh and Ponnamm, 2016), as they can provide

valuable input. Therefore, this study hypothesized that:

H₇. E-scape is positively associated with e-satisfaction.

H₈. E-scape is positively associated with e-trust

2.6 e-Satisfaction

Satisfaction is widely accepted as well as extensively researched topics in the field of marketing (Matute, Polo-Redondo and Utrillas, 2016; Ziggers and Henseler, 2016; Zhuang and Babin, 2015). A variety of autonomous and dependent concepts and actions have been acknowledged and used to find the drivers of e-satisfaction. However, there is no agreement on what is the main driver of online e-satisfaction (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018). Meanwhile, the research proposed that website features, in specific ease of use and website design (e-scape), plays an important role. Generally, satisfaction is the consumer evaluation of the purchase relative to their primary expectations (Zheng, Lee and Cheung, 2017). The consequence of this assessment is an attitude—a choice to be satisfied or dissatisfied. If this evaluation matches with initial consumer's expectations of the buying experience, service or product, a state of satisfaction occurs. This satisfaction or dissatisfaction influence future purchase intentions i.e. loyalty. Therefore, this study hypothesized that:

H₉. e-Satisfaction is positively associated with e-trust.

H₁₀. e-Satisfaction is positively associated with e-loyalty.

2.7 e-Trust

Generally, trust is a collection of thoughts apprehended by a shopper as to definite qualities of the seller, as well as the probable behavior of the seller in the future. In this context, past literature identifies numerous dimensions of trust. For example perceived trustworthiness, generosity (Tsao, Hsieh and Lin, 2016), integrity, and competence (Kesharwani, Sreeram and Desai, 2017). Trust is an essential aspect of the commercial world. This aspect is important as individuals often face uncertainty and they easily effected by behaviors and attitudes of customers as well as the sellers (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018).

Online trust has a significant part in producing satisfaction and predictable consequences in online dealings (Kesharwani, Sreeram and Desai, 2017). The existence

of trust upsurges customers' beliefs that e-vendors will not involve in devious behaviour. Thakur (2018) defines the concept of online trust as security promise, reputé, web probing, fulfilment (i.e. readiness to customize), appearance (i.e. web quality), technology and communications (e.g. e-forums). Various types of risks (e.g., financial and security risk etc.) have emerged with the rapid growth of e-commerce. Therefore, customers depend on their belief in the merchant, to mitigate the effects of their ambiguity toward their associations in the online environment (Pandey and Chawla, 2018).

H₁₁: e-trust has a positive relationship with e-loyalty.

Loyalty as an Antecedent of satisfaction and loyalty: Customer loyalty is an intentional emphasis for the utmost businesses (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018). Past literature outlines loyalty as the association among the relative attitude for a unit and patronage behavior. Research validates a strong relationship between satisfaction and loyalty (Punyatoya, 2018; Khan and Rahman, 2016). In an online shopping environment, Wang and Kim (2019) explained loyalty as the subjective possibility that a shopper will make coming acquisitions from the identical web site. Kaura, Prasad, and Sharma (2015) categorized loyalty in terms of the necessity and acknowledgment of a web site's goods or services, as well as the shopper's belief in enduring to acquisition goods or services from the web site. Riquelme and Román (2014) outline the attitude measurement of loyalty as an intent to continue buying goods or services. Consistent with these researchers, this study treats loyalty as the shopper's satisfactory attitude concerning an electronic vendor's website causing in recurrence purchasing behavior and affirmative recommendations to others.

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Sample and Procedure

The researcher adopted quantitative methods to collect data by distributing self-administered questionnaires to the respondents in Klang Valley in Malaysia as it includes the major cities of Malaysia like Greater Kuala Lumpur, Selangor, Rawang and many more. The unit of analysis in this study is the individual customer level. The researcher

approached the online shopper randomly. The pre-requisite for selecting any respondent was a recent online purchase or visit of any online shopping hypermarket. This was done to ensure that respondents have experience or familiarity with online shopping. Around 388 customers were approached for this study with a response rate of 78%. After the responses were screened, a total of 291 were found valid and hence usable for final data analysis, with a valid response rate of 75%.

Overall, the sample demographics presented in table 1 characterized the national distribution of sex, income, and education in Malaysia. Of the 291 respondents, 53% were female and 47% were male respondents. 34% respondents were below 20 years; 28% of the respondents were between 21 and 30 years of age; 17% were between the age group of 31 to 40 years of age; 13% were between 41 and 50 years of age, and 8% were older than 50 years of age. Furthermore, it shows that in the case of ethnicity, 56% of respondents were Malay, 27% of respondents were Chinese, 11% of respondents were Indians while 6% belongs to some other races. In terms of education, 11% of respondents have passed SPM; 19% were SPTM; 46% have a degree; 19% have a master's level education; 3 had Ph. D degree while 2% have some other education. The income level of respondents shows that 19% reported they have income below 1,500; 27% of the respondents have income between 1,501 to 2,000; 30% had income between 2,001 to 2,500; 16% of respondents have income between 2,501 to 3,000 and rest have income above 3,000. Lastly, in terms of online visit, table 1 shows that 5% had never visited any online shopping website or purchased online, 22% visits once a week; 15% visits twice a week; 23% visits fortnightly; 22% visits once a month and 13% visits option was not mentioned in the questionnaire.

Table 1: Respondents Characteristics		
Demographic Variable Category	Respondent's Demographic Profile Characteristics	
	Selection Category	Percentage
Gender	Male	47
	Female	53
Age	Less than 20	34
	21 to 30	28
	31 to 40	17
	41 to 50	13
	Above 50	8

Ethnicity	Malay	56
	Chinese	27
	Indian	11
	Others	6
Education	SPM	11
	SPTM	19
	Degree	46
	Master	19
	PhD	3
	Others	2
Monthly Income	Less than 1,500	19
	1,501 to 2,000	27
	2,001 to 2,500	30
	2,501 to 3,000	18
	Above 3,000	6
Store visit	Never	5
	Once a week	22
	Twice a week	15
	Fortnightly	23
	Once a month	22
	Others	13

3.2 Questionnaire development and measures

The survey instrument utilized in this study consisted of items with a five-point Likert scale (strongly agree to strongly disagree) derived from past studies. The respondents were requested to reflect on their recent visit to any online shopping web site and/or online purchase made. The instrument has seven different constructs and respective items. For Perceived usefulness, Perceived ease of use, e-escape, e-satisfaction, e-trust and e-loyalty the study adopted four items for each from Ribbink, Riel, Liljander and Streukens (2004). Lastly, for Privacy/Security four items were taken from a study conducted by Limbu, Wolf and Lunsford, (2011).

3.3 Method of Analysis

AMOS version 22 was employed to test the proposed hypothesis through Structural equation modeling. Hair et al., (2010, p. 641) recommended that “SEM is most suitable when the investigation has many constructs, each indicated by numerous measured variables and allows for all of the association/comparisons to be measured simultaneously.” Many others have clearly reported that that “SEM overcome the limits of bivariate analyses through the simultaneous analysis of all the complex associations

between the constructs.” This research uses the maximum likelihood method estimation in the SEM model. As recommended the measurement model was measured before the assessment of the structural model. Whereas the measurement model provided a valuation of the reliability and validity of the study concepts, the structural model measured the causal associations between the concepts.

3.3.1 Common Method Bias

A self-administered questionnaire approach was adopted to collect primary data related to variables under investigation. The relationship among variables can be influenced by the common method bias. Chin (1998) recommended procedure was followed to avoid any possibility of this. The respondents were guaranteed the privacy of the answers and were fortified to answer fairly. Besides verbally mentioning this, it was also highlighted in the inform consent form. Furthermore, to make sure that data is free from common method bias, the researcher conducted two additional statistical tests. First, test results from Harman's single factor showed very poor model fit = 865.21, $df = 89$, $\chi^2/df = 9.72$, GFI = 0.517, CFI = 0.554, TLI = 0.568, IFI = .851, RMSEA = 0.236). Second, the common bias method adjusted correlation matrix was computed. After the adjustments pattern of correlations remained the same, therefore, it became obvious that the data set in this study is free from common method bias problem.

4. EMPIRICAL RESULTS

3.4.1 Measurement Model

The measurement model exhibited a decent model fit to the data with 147.540, $df = 77$, p -value 0.00, RMSEA 0.067 (0.032 to 0.069), IFI 0.934, TLI 0.910, CFI 0.952, GFI 0.952, and $\chi^2/df = 1.644$. As the minimum acceptable level of model fit statistics recommended by Hair et al. (2010) met by model, therefore, it is decided that the dimension items associated with their fundamental latent construct.

The discriminant and convergent validity of the dimension scales are assessed after this and presented in Table 2. For assessing the discriminant and convergent validity of measurement scales, the measurement model was utilized. Table 2 shows that all measurement items loaded significantly on the corresponding latent constructs. The

standardized regression weights (λ) ranged from 0.63 to 0.95. The researcher followed Hair et al., (2006) to assess the Cronbach's alpha (α) and composite reliability (ρ) values of the constructs and all were above the recommended threshold levels of 0.70. Additionally, the average variance extracted (AVE) of each construct was above 0.50, suggesting that each has convergent validity (Hair et al., 1998).

Tabel 2. Measurement Model

Constructs and items					
Perceived usefulness	λ	t-Statistics	α	ρ	AVE
PU 1	0.76	*	0.88	0.88	0.55
PU 2	0.66	10.33			
PU 3	0.65	9.45			
PU 4	0.63	10.22			
Perceived ease of use					
EOU 1	0.69	*	0.87	0.87	0.66
EOU 2	0.72	9.45			
EOU 3	0.68	9.55			
EOU 4	0.85	10.54			
e-Scape					
E-Scap 1	0.76	*	0.83	0.83	0.74
E-Scap 2	0.86	9.21			
E-Scap 3	0.78	10.11			
E-Scap 4	0.75	9.88			
Security / Privacy					
PS 1	0.75	*	0.89	0.89	0.59
PS 2	0.78	17.55			
PS 3	0.74	17.98			
PS 4	0.77	16.45			
e-satisfaction					
ES 1	0.84	*	0.88	0.9	0.73
ES 2	0.79	13.54			
ES 3	0.84	12.66			
ES 4	0.88	17.11			
e-trust					
ET 1	0.95	*	0.87	0.84	0.69
ET 2	0.91	12.66			
ET 3	0.78	14.01			
ET 4	0.89	15.95			
e-loyalty					
EL 1	0.76	*	0.86	0.88	0.71
EL 2	0.78	17.05			
EL 3	0.84	16.10			
EL 4	0.82	15.44			

Researcher followed Fornell and Larcker (1981) approach to assess the

discriminant validity. As discriminant validity is achieved when the AVE of the construct is bigger than the correlations among the particular constructs. As shown in Table 3, discriminant validity was assured as AVE of each construct was bigger than the squared correlation among any two constructs. Furthermore, the research is free from the halo effect as the detailed examination of within and among construct items correlations and multifaceted bifactor analysis proves. The mean and standard deviations and correlations matrix are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Descriptive Statistics and Correlations among the Constructs

Constructs	Mean	SD	PU	EOU	PS	e-scp	ES	ET	EL
(PU)	4.35	1.157	0.55	0.23	0.15	0.29	0.23	0.15	0.15
Ease of use (EOU)	4.55	0.977	0.49	0.66	0.16	0.33	0.56	0.16	0.16
Privacy /Security (PS)	3.99	0.912	-0.35	-0.34	0.74	0.08	-0.34	-0.53	-0.53
E-Scape (e-scap)	4.98	0.996	0.58	0.47	0.24	0.59	0.47	-0.29	-0.29
e-satisfaction (ES)	3.54	0.945	0.12	0.45	0.74	0.58	0.73	0.54	0.54
e-trust (ET)	4.65	0.984	0.65	0.65	0.65	0.62	0.69	0.69	0.33
e-loyalty (EL)	4.78	0.936	0.87	0.67	0.44	0.22	0.12	0.71	0.71

Note: The diagonal values represent average variance extracted. The lower diagonal values represent correlation among the constructs. The upper diagonal values represent squared correlations between the constructs. ** $p > 0.01$

3.4.2 Structural Model Fit

H₁ states that perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction. As presented in table 4, this hypothesis was supported ($\beta = 0.065$, $t\text{-value} = 2.0105$, $p < 0.05$). H₂ predicted that perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-trust, the results revealed that the path between perceived usefulness and e-trust was insignificant ($\beta = 0.014$, $t\text{-value} = 0.408$, $p > 0.05$), therefore H₂ was not supported. H₃ stated that perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction, the results in table 4 ($\beta = -0.084$, $t\text{-value} = -0.649$, $p < 0.05$) shows that this hypothesis is supported. H₄ predicted that perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-trust and it is supported ($\beta = 0.125$, $t\text{-value} = 7.164$, $p < 0.05$). H₅ stated that perceived online security/privacy is positively associated with e-satisfaction, the results revealed that the path between perceived online security/privacy and e-satisfaction was significant ($\beta =$

0.387, t-value = 11.646, $p > 0.05$), therefore H5 was supported.

H₆ predicted that perceived online security/privacy is positively associated with e-trust and it is supported ($\beta = 0.847$, t-value = -2.564, $p > 0.05$). H₇ predicted that e-scape is positively associated with e-satisfaction, the results revealed that the path between e-scape and e-satisfaction was insignificant ($\beta = 0.135$, t-value = 1.164, $p > 0.05$), therefore H₇ was not supported. H₈ stated that E-scape is positively associated with e-trust and results shows that it is supported ($\beta = 0.118$, t-value = -2.156, $p > 0.05$). H₉ stated that e-Satisfaction is positively associated with e-trust and it is supported ($\beta = 0.654$, t-value = 3.126, $p > 0.05$). H₁₀ stated that e-Satisfaction is positively associated with e-loyalty, the path between e-satisfaction and e-loyalty was significant ($\beta = -0.078$, t-value = 8.958, $p > 0.05$), therefore H₁₀ was supported. H₁₁ predicted that e-trust has a positive relationship with e-loyalty and it is supported ($\beta = 0.488$, t-value = 3.341, $p > 0.05$).

Table 4. Structural model results

Hypothesis	Path coefficient	t-value	Supported
H1 (EOU → ESAT)	0.065**	2.105	Yes
H2 (EOU → ET)	0.014	0.408	Not
H3 (PU → ESAT)	-0.084**	-0.649	Yes
H4 (PU → ET)	0.125	7.164	Yes
H5 (PS → ESAT)	0.387***	11.646	Yes
H6 (PS → ET)	0.847***	-2.564	Yes
H7 (ESC → ESAT)	0.135	1.164	Not
H8 (ESC → ET)	0.118**	-2.156	Yes
H9 (ESAT → ET)	0.654***	3.126	Yes
H10 (ESAT → EL)	-0.078**	8.958	Yes
H11 (ET → EL)	0.488***	3.341	Yes

* <0.10 , ** <0.5 , *** <0.1

5. CONCLUSION

The objective of the present study was to determine the factors that contribute to online shopping loyalty. Researchers use perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use,

privacy/security and e-scape as customer evaluations of electronic service and developing e-trust/e-satisfaction, which ultimately lead to e-loyalty. Building online trust and satisfaction leading to e-loyalty is an important constituent for any online business to flourish in an e-commerce environment – where dealings are further detached and unidentified – as this affects customers' loyalty. In e-commerce, customers are not able to experience products directly (with some digital exemptions), and customers make purchase decisions on their perception about the web site and the information available and provided by online retailers. This study developed and tested the research model in the context of online shoppers in Malaysia. The research suggested that e-retailers should develop a website, which is secure, protect consumer privacy, are easy to navigate and useful. For enhancing satisfaction on consumer's privacy and security concerns, websites should use a variety of techniques to feel benevolent. Customer higher expectations about the respect of their privacy and security must be matched with the assurance of safeguarding for their personal information. Furthermore, web site perceived ease of use and its usefulness must be enhanced with various marketing and business strategies. Companies may, therefore; increase e-customer loyalty indirectly by refining the promise aspect of their web site in terms of perceived usefulness, ease of use, privacy, and escape.

6. DISCUSSION AND MANAGERIAL IMPLICATIONS

With the swift development of online retailing, customer loyalty is at stake and has become a major concern for online business. This study empirically tested a model that determines factors crucial in creating e-trust and e-satisfaction. In line with the objectives of this study and based on past literature eleven hypotheses were proposed out of which nine hypotheses are supported. Let us inspect the outcomes of this study in more detail. For example, H_1 proposed that perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction and it is supported. These findings are in line with previous studies. Punyatoya (2018) claimed that perceived usefulness is the most influential determinant affecting online initial trust and satisfaction. Therefore, it may be concluded higher perceived usefulness can resolve or minimize online shoppers reservations by tightening information asymmetry among consumers and e-venders, supporting customers in

conducting an effective and efficient online purchase. Similarly, H₂ predicted that perceived usefulness has a positive relationship with e-trust. Divergent to estimate, outcomes did not find any support for this relationship. H₃ proposed that perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-Satisfaction and it was substantial. It means that retailers must strive for higher perceived ease of use which would result in higher e-satisfaction. Likewise, H₄ prophesied that perceived ease of use has a positive relationship with e-trust and it was supported. Thus, the more rich the valuable functions or information that web site offers, the greater the online initial belief that customers are expected to have.

H₅ proposed that perceived online security/privacy is positively related to e-satisfaction and H₆ proposed that perceived online security/privacy is positively associated with e-trust, both the hypothesis is supported. The findings are in line with previous studies. For example, Punyatoya (2018) claimed that e-retailers should build web sites that respect consumer privacy and also secure. To achieve the objective of providing a secure and private e-environment, e-retailers should provide more than one secure payment options (cash on delivery or Pay-pal), the secure web server for conducting the transaction. The security policies, guidelines and instructions must be mentioned related to credit card scams. This provision of information concerning privacy policies in a perfect manner that will increase online shoppers' consideration and understanding. In this context, e-retailers must keep customer data gathering at a possible minimum level. Asking and collecting too much information about customers may seriously damage consumers' assessments and their intents to rebuy from the same vendor.

Similarly, H₇ predicted that e-scape is positively associated with e-satisfaction and it was not supported. The study findings are in line with Limbu, Wolf and Lunsford (2011) who claimed that better website design is not related to e-satisfaction. H₈ predicted that e-scape is positively associated with e-trust and it was supported. In the same context, Pan and Zinkhan (2006) report that e-scape influence shoppers' trust in the online store and thus their tendency to patronize again. H₉ and H₁₀ predicted that e-Satisfaction is positively associated with e-trust .and e-loyalty. It was supported. These

findings are consistent with Khan and Rahman (2016) and Kesharwani, Sreeram and Desai (2017), but is contradictory to Lemon and Verhoef (2016). Likewise, H11 predicted that e-trust has a positive relationship with e-loyalty and it was also supported. There are numerous studies in the past which support this relationship (Tankovic and Benazic, 2018; Tsao, Hsieh and Lin, 2016). Therefore, higher degree of online initial trust can trigger a higher level of re-purchase intention (Thakur, R (2018).

5.1 Limitations and Suggestions for further Research

Similar to many other studies, this study also has several limitations. Many relate to the sample and the overall research design. This study has evaluated the overall consumer perception of online websites. However, the different customer may evaluate different website differently (Faqih, 2016), which is not accounted for in this study. Future studies may let all participants visit the same number and types of websites to minimize this effect. This study is likely to have self-selection as bias as this study asked the participant to evaluate any online website they recently visited or purchased from.

The researcher recommends that future studies should collect more information related to participant demographics. The sample size was of moderate size, future studies can be conducted with a relatively large sample size from different industries. This might increase the generalizability of the findings. Furthermore, this study has collected the information from students, academicians and other university staff. The researcher collected the data from these groups as, Tran and Strutton (2016) claimed that both clusters are very accustomed to the internet and have a high technology willingness. Future studies should collect data from either of one subject from this cluster.

REFERENCES

- Anderson, J.C., and Gerbing, D.W. (1988), "Structural Equation Modeling in Practice: A Review and Recommended Two-Step Approach" *Psychological Bulletin*, 103 (3), pp. 411-423.
- Butt, M.M., and Aftab, M. (2013), "Incorporating attitude towards Halal banking in an integrated service quality, satisfaction, trust", *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 31(1)1, pp. 6-23
- Davis, F.D. (1989), "Perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use, and user acceptance of information technology", *MIS Quarterly*, Vol. 13 No. 3, pp. 319-40.
- Faqih, K.M. (2016), "An empirical analysis of factors predicting the behavioral intention to adopt Internet shopping technology among non-shoppers in a developing country context: does gender matter?", *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 30

- (3), pp. 140-156
- Fornell, C., and Larcker, D.F. (1981). *Evaluating Structural Equation Models with Unobservable Variables and Measurement Error*. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 18 (1), pp. 39-50
- Francis, B., Hasna, I., Park, J.C., and Wu, Q. (2015), "Gender differences in financial reporting decision making: evidence from accounting conservatism", *Contemporary Accounting Research*, 32 (3), pp. 1285-1318.
- Hair, J.F., Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L., & Black, W.C. (2010), *Multivariate Data Analysis*, Prentice Hall, Upper Saddle River, NJ.
- Hair, J.F., Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L., & Black, W.C. (1998), *Multivariate Data Analysis*, Prentice Hall, Upper Saddle River, NJ.
- Henseler, J., Hubona, G. and Ray, P.A. (2016), "Using PLS path modeling in new technology research: updated guidelines", *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 116 (1), pp. 2-20.
- Kerkhof, P. and Van Noort, G. (2010), "Third party internet seals: reviewing the effects on online consumer trust. *Encyclopedia of E-Business Development and Management in the Global Economy*", Information Science Reference, Vol. 22 No. 5, pp. 701-708.
- Khan, I., and Rahman, Z. (2016), "E-tail brand experience's influence on e-brand trust and e-brand loyalty", *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 44 (6), pp. 588 – 606.
- Kesharwani, A., Sreeram, A., and Desai, S. (2017), "Factors affecting satisfaction and loyalty in online grocery shopping: an integrated model", *Journal of Indian Business Research*, 9 (2), pp. 36-56
- Kaura, V., Prasad, C.S., and Sharma, S. (2015), "Service quality, service convenience, price and fairness, customer loyalty, and the mediating role of customer satisfaction", *International Journal of Bank Marketing*, 33 (4), pp. 404-422
- Limbu, Y., Wolf, M. and Lunsford, D. (2011), "Consumers' perceptions of online ethics and its effects on satisfaction and loyalty", *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing*, Vol. 5 No. 1, pp. 71-89.
- Lemon, K.N., and Verhoef, P.C. (2016), "Understanding customer experience throughout the customer journey", *Journal of Marketing*, 80 (6), pp. 69-96.
- Lim, S.Y., Heng, P.C., and Cheah, C.S. (2016), "Customers' online website satisfaction in online apparel purchase: a study of generation Y in Malaysia", *Asia Pacific Management Review*, 21 (2), pp. 74-78.
- McLean, G., and Wilson, A. (2016), "Evolving the online customer experience...is the role for online customer support?", *Computers in Human Behavior*, 60 (3), pp. 602-610.
- Matute, J., Polo-Redondo, Y. and Utrillas, A. (2016), "The influence of EWOM characteristics on online repurchase intention: mediating roles of trust and perceived usefulness", *Online Information Review*, 40 (7), pp. 1090-1110
- Punyatoya, P. (2018), "Effects of cognitive and affective trust on online customer behavior", *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 4 (7), pp. 36-66
- Pandey, S., and Chawla, D. (2018). "Online customer experience (OCE) in clothing e-retail: Exploring OCE dimensions and their impact on satisfaction and loyalty – Does gender matter?", *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 46 (3), pp.323-346.
- Riquelme, I.P. and Román, S. (2014), "Is the influence of privacy and security on online trust the same for all type of consumers?", *Electronic Markets*, 24 (2), pp. 135-

149.

- Ribbink, D., van Riel, A. C. R., Liljander, V., & Streukens, S. (2004). "Comfort your online customer: quality, trust and loyalty on the internet", *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, 14 (6), 446–456
- Sreejesh, S. and Ponnamm, A. (2016), "Investigating the process through which e-servicescape creates e-loyalty in travel and tourism websites", *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 34 (1), pp. 20-39
- Shobeiri, S., Mazaheri, E. and Laroche, M. (2018), "Creating the right customer experience online: the influence of culture", *Journal of Marketing Communications*, 24 (3), pp. 270-280.
- Tankovic, AC., and Benazic, D. (2018). "The perception of e-servicescape and its influence on perceived e-shopping value and customer loyalty", *Online Information Review*, 1 (3), pp. 35-69
- Tsao, WC., Hsieh, M.T., and Lin, M.Y. (2016). "Intensifying online loyalty! The power of website quality and the perceived value of consumer/seller relationship", *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 116 (9), pp. 987-2010.
- Thakur, R (2018). "The role of self-efficacy and customer satisfaction in driving loyalty to the mobile shopping application", *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 46 (3), pp.283-303.
- Tankovic, A.C., and Benazic, D. (2018). "The perception of e-servicescape and its influence on perceived e-shopping value and customer loyalty", *Online Information Review*, 2 (5), pp. 56-86
- Tandon, U., Kiran, R., and Sah, A.N. (2016), "Customer satisfaction using website functionality, perceived usability and perceived usefulness towards online shopping in India", *Information Development*, 32 (5), pp. 1657-1673
- Tran, G.A., and Strutton, D. (2016), "Investigating e-servicescape, trust, E-WOM, and customer loyalty", *Proceedings of the Academy of Marketing Science*, pp. 77-81.
- Wu, W.Y., Quyen, P.T., and Rivas, A.A. (2016), "How e-servicescapes affect customer online shopping intention: the moderating effects of gender and online purchasing experience", *Information Systems and e-Business Management*, 15 (3), pp. 689-715.
- Wang, W., and Kim, S (2019) "Lady first? The gender difference in the influence of service quality on online consumer behavior", *Nankai Business Review International*, 4 (6), pp. 36-69
- Yoon, S. (2002), "The antecedents and consequences of trust in online-purchase decisions", *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, Vol. 16 No. 2, pp. 47-63.
- Yoon, E., Guffey, H. and Kijewski, V. (1993), "The effects of information and company reputation on intention to buy a business service", *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 27 No. 4, pp. 2015-222.
- Ziggers, G.W. and Henseler, J. (2016), "The reinforcing effect of a firm's customer orientation and supply-base orientation on performance", *Industrial Marketing Management*, 52 (4), pp. 18-26
- Zhuang, W., and Babin, B.J. (2015), "The influence of e-service quality on customer value perception and satisfaction: the case of third-party websites", *Marketing Dynamism and Sustainability*, 6 (3), pp.114-117.
- Zheng, X., Lee, M., and Cheung, C. (2017). "Examining e-loyalty towards online shopping platforms: the role of coupon proneness and value consciousness", *Internet Research*, 27 (3), pp. 3-26